

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

MD INSIDER, INC.,  
Plaintiff,  
v.  
DAVID BROSSO, an individual,  
Defendant

Case No. 15CV2395 DMS NLS

**ORDER GRANTING JOINT  
MOTION FOR STIPULATED  
PROTECTIVE ORDER AS  
MODIFIED**

[DKT. NO. 15]

The Court recognizes that at least some of the documents and information ("materials") being sought through discovery in the above-captioned action are, for competitive reasons, normally kept confidential by the parties. The parties have agreed to be bound by the terms of this Protective Order ("Order") in this action.

The materials to be exchanged throughout the course of the litigation between the parties may contain trade secret or other confidential research, technical, cost, price, marketing or other commercial information, as is contemplated by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c)(7). The purpose of this Order is to protect the confidentiality of such materials as much as practical during the litigation.

1 For good cause shown, the court **GRANTS** the joint motion for protective order,  
2 as modified in paragraph no. 13. THEREFORE:

3

4 **DEFINITIONS**

5 1. The term "Confidential Information" will mean and include information  
6 contained or disclosed in any materials, including documents, portions of documents,  
7 answers to interrogatories, responses to requests for admissions, trial testimony,  
8 deposition testimony, and transcripts of trial testimony and depositions, including data,  
9 summaries, and compilations derived therefrom that is deemed to be Confidential  
10 Information by any party to which it belongs.

11 2. The term "materials" will include, but is not be limited to: documents;  
12 correspondence; memoranda; bulletins; blueprints; specifications; customer lists or  
13 other material that identify customers or potential customers; price lists or schedules or  
14 other matter identifying pricing; minutes; telegrams; letters; statements; cancelled  
15 checks; contracts; invoices; drafts; books of account; worksheets; notes of  
16 conversations; desk diaries; appointment books; expense accounts; recordings;  
17 photographs; motion pictures; compilations from which information can be obtained  
18 and translated into reasonably usable form through detection devices; sketches;  
19 drawings; notes (including laboratory notebooks and records); reports; instructions;  
20 disclosures; other writings; models and prototypes and other physical objects.

21 3. The term "counsel" will mean outside counsel of record, and other  
22 attorneys, paralegals, secretaries, and other support staff employed in the law firms  
23 identified below:

24 Baker Botts L.L.P.

25 Pashman Stein P.C.

26 Spector Gadon & Rosen P.C.

27 Stokes Wagner Hunt Maretz & Terrell, ALC

1           4. Each party to this litigation that produces or discloses any materials,  
2 answers to interrogatories, responses to requests for admission, trial testimony,  
3 deposition testimony, and transcripts of trial testimony and depositions, or information  
4 that the producing party believes should be subject to this Protective Order may  
5 designate the same as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL  
6 ONLY."

7           a. Designation as "CONFIDENTIAL": Any party may designate  
8 information as "CONFIDENTIAL" only if, in the good faith belief  
9 of such party and its counsel, the unrestricted disclosure of such  
10 information could be potentially prejudicial to the business or  
11 operations of such party.

12           b. Designation as "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL ONLY": Any  
13 party may designate information as "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR  
14 COUNSEL ONLY" only if, in the good faith belief of such party and  
15 its counsel, the information is among that considered to be most  
16 sensitive by the party, including but not limited to trade secret or  
17 other confidential research, development, financial or other  
18 commercial information.

19           5. In the event the producing party elects to produce materials for inspection,  
20 no marking need be made by the producing party in advance of the initial inspection.  
21 For purposes of the initial inspection, all materials produced will be considered as  
22 "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL ONLY," and must be treated as such pursuant to  
23 the terms of this Order. Thereafter, upon selection of specified materials for copying by  
24 the inspecting party, the producing party must, within a reasonable time prior to  
25 producing those materials to the inspecting party, mark the copies of those materials  
26 that contain Confidential Information with the appropriate confidentiality marking.

27           6. Whenever a deposition taken on behalf of any party involves a disclosure  
28

1 of Confidential Information of any party:

2 a. the deposition or portions of the deposition must be designated as  
3 containing Confidential Information subject to the provisions of  
4 this Order; such designation must be made on the record whenever  
5 possible, but a party may designate portions of depositions as  
6 containing Confidential Information after transcription of the  
7 proceedings; [A] party will have until fourteen (14) days after  
8 receipt of the deposition transcript to inform the other party or  
9 parties to the action of the portions of the transcript to be designated  
10 "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL  
11 ONLY."

12 b. the disclosing party will have the right to exclude from attendance  
13 at the deposition, during such time as the Confidential Information  
14 is to be disclosed, any person other than the deponent, counsel  
15 (including their staff and associates), the court reporter, and the  
16 person(s) agreed upon pursuant to paragraph 8 below; and

17 c. the originals of the deposition transcripts and all copies of the  
18 deposition must bear the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or  
19 "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL ONLY," as appropriate, and  
20 the original or any copy ultimately presented to a court for filing  
21 must not be filed unless it can be accomplished under seal, identified  
22 as being subject to this Order, and protected from being opened  
23 except by order of this Court.

24 7. All Confidential Information designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or  
25 "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL ONLY" must not be disclosed by the receiving  
26 party to anyone other than those persons designated within this order and must be  
27 handled in the manner set forth below and, in any event, must not be used for any

1 purpose other than in connection with this litigation, unless and until such designation  
 2 is removed either by agreement of the parties, or by order of the Court.

3       8. Information designated "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL ONLY"  
 4 must be viewed only by counsel (as defined in paragraph 3) of the receiving party, and  
 5 by independent experts under the conditions set forth in this Paragraph. The right of any  
 6 independent expert to receive any Confidential Information will be subject to the  
 7 advance approval of such expert by the producing party or by permission of the Court.  
 8 The party seeking approval of an independent expert must provide the producing party  
 9 with the name and curriculum vitae of the proposed independent expert, and an executed  
 10 copy of the form attached hereto as Exhibit A, in advance of providing any Confidential  
 11 Information of the producing party to the expert. Any objection by the producing party  
 12 to an independent expert receiving Confidential Information must be made in writing  
 13 within seven (7) [CHANGED TO 7 FROM 14] days following receipt of the  
 14 identification of the proposed expert. Confidential Information may be disclosed to an  
 15 independent expert if the seven (7) day period has passed and no objection has been  
 16 made. The approval of independent experts must not be unreasonably withheld.

17       9. Information designated "CONFIDENTIAL" must be viewed only by  
 18 counsel (as defined in paragraph 3) of the receiving party, by independent experts  
 19 (pursuant to the terms of paragraph 8), and by the additional individuals listed below,  
 20 provided each such individual has read this Order in advance of disclosure and has  
 21 agreed in writing to be bound by its terms:

- 22           (a) Executives who are required to participate in policy decisions with  
 23 reference to this action;
- 24           (b) Technical personnel of the parties with whom Counsel for the  
 25 parties find it necessary to consult, in the discretion of such counsel,  
 26 in preparation for trial of this action; and
- 27           (c) Stenographic and clerical employees associated with the

individuals identified above.

10. With respect to material designated "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL ONLY," any person indicated on the face of the document to be its originator, author or a recipient of a copy of the document, may be shown the same.

11. All information which has been designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL -FOR COUNSEL ONLY" by the producing or disclosing party, and any and all reproductions of that information, must be retained in the custody of the counsel for the receiving party identified in paragraph 3, except that independent experts authorized to view such information under the terms of this Order may retain custody of copies such as are necessary for their participation in this litigation.

12. Before any materials produced in discovery, answers to interrogatories, responses to requests for admissions, deposition transcripts, or other documents which are designated as Confidential Information are filed with the Court for any purpose, the party seeking to file such material must seek permission of the Court to file the material under seal.

13. Any party may object to a designation of the materials as Confidential Information. The party objecting to confidentiality must notify, in writing, counsel for the designating party of the objected-to materials and the grounds for the objection. If the dispute is not resolved consensually between the parties within seven (7) days of receipt of such a notice of objections, the objecting party may move the Court for a ruling on the objection. The materials at issue must be treated as Confidential Information, as designated by the designating party, until the Court has ruled on the objection or the matter has been otherwise resolved. Any disputes brought to the court under this provision must comply with the time limits set forth in this chambers' rules regarding resolution of discovery disputes.

14. All Confidential Information must be held in confidence by those

1 inspecting or receiving it, and must be used only for purposes of this action. Counsel  
2 for each party, and each person receiving Confidential Information must take reasonable  
3 precautions to prevent the unauthorized or inadvertent disclosure of such information.  
4 If Confidential Information is disclosed to any person other than a person authorized by  
5 this Order, the party responsible for the unauthorized disclosure must immediately bring  
6 all pertinent facts relating to the unauthorized disclosure to the attention of the other  
7 parties and, without prejudice to any rights and remedies of the other parties, make  
8 every effort to prevent further disclosure by the party and by the person(s) receiving the  
9 unauthorized disclosure.

10 15. No party will be responsible to another party for disclosure of Confidential  
11 Information under this Order if the information in question is not labeled or otherwise  
12 identified as such in accordance with this Order.

13 16. If a party, through inadvertence, produces any Confidential Information  
14 without labeling or marking or otherwise designating it as such in accordance with this  
15 Order, the designating party may give written notice to the receiving party that the  
16 document or thing produced is deemed Confidential Information, and that the document  
17 or thing produced should be treated as such in accordance with that designation under  
18 this Order. The receiving party must treat the materials as confidential, once the  
19 designating party so notifies the receiving party. If the receiving party has disclosed the  
20 materials before receiving the designation, the receiving party must notify the  
21 designating party in writing of each such disclosure. Counsel for the parties will agree  
22 on a mutually acceptable manner of labeling or marking the inadvertently produced  
23 materials as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - FOR COUNSEL ONLY" -  
24 SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER.

25 17. Nothing within this order will prejudice the right of any party to object to  
26 the production of any discovery material on the grounds that the material is protected  
27 as privileged or as attorney work product.

1       18. Nothing in this Order will bar counsel from rendering advice to their  
2 clients with respect to this litigation and, in the course thereof, relying upon any  
3 information designated as Confidential Information, provided that the contents of the  
4 information must not be disclosed.

5       19. This Order will be without prejudice to the right of any party to oppose  
6 production of any information for lack of relevance or any other ground other than the  
7 mere presence of Confidential Information. The existence of this Order must not be  
8 used by either party as a basis for discovery that is otherwise improper under the Federal  
9 Rules of Civil Procedure.

10       20. Nothing within this order will be construed to prevent disclosure of  
11 Confidential Information if such disclosure is required by law or by order of the Court.

12       21. Upon final termination of this action, including any and all appeals,  
13 counsel for each party must, upon request of the producing party, return all Confidential  
14 Information to the party that produced the information, including any copies, excerpts,  
15 and summaries of that information, or must destroy same at the option of the receiving  
16 party, and must purge all such information from all machine-readable media on which  
17 it resides. Notwithstanding the foregoing, counsel for each party may retain all  
18 pleadings, briefs, memoranda, motions, and other documents filed with the Court that  
19 refer to or incorporate Confidential Information, and will continue to be bound by this  
20 Order with respect to all such retained information. Further, attorney work product  
21 materials that contain Confidential Information need not be destroyed, but, if they are  
22 not destroyed, the person in possession of the attorney work product will continue to be  
23 bound by this Order with respect to all such retained information.

24       22. The restrictions and obligations set forth within this order will not apply to  
25 any information that: (a) the parties agree should not be designated Confidential  
26 Information; (b) the parties agree, or the Court rules, is already public knowledge; (c)  
27 the parties agree, or the Court rules, has become public knowledge other than as a result  
28

1 of disclosure by the receiving party, its employees, or its agents in violation of this  
2 Order; or (d) has come or will come into the receiving party's legitimate knowledge  
3 independently of the production by the designating party. Prior knowledge must be  
4 established by pre-production documentation.

5 23. The restrictions and obligations within this order will not be deemed to  
6 prohibit discussions of any Confidential Information with anyone if that person already  
7 has or obtains legitimate possession of that information.

8 24. Transmission by email is acceptable for all notification purposes within  
9 this order.

10 25. This Order may be modified by agreement of the parties, subject to  
11 approval by the Court.

12 26. The Court may modify the terms and conditions of this Order for good  
13 cause, or in the interest of justice, or on its own order at any time in these proceedings.  
14 The parties prefer that the Court provide them with notice of the Court's intent to modify  
15 the Order and the content of those modifications, prior to entry of such an order.

16       ///

17       ///

18       ///

19       ///

20       ///

21       ///

22       ///

23       ///

24       ///

25       ///

26       ///

27       ///

28

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2 DATED: April 8, 2016

/s/ Kevin Sadler

3 Kevin Sadler (SBN 283765)  
4 kevin.sadler@bakerbotts.com  
5 Karina Smith (SBN 286680)  
6 karina.smith@bakerbotts.com  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1001 Page Mill Road, Bldg. 1, Ste. 200  
Palo Alto, CA 94304  
Telephone: 1.650.739.7500  
Fax: 1.650.739.7699

7  
8 Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counter-  
9 Defendant  
MD INSIDER, INC.

10 DATED: April 8, 2016

/s/Rich Gallucci

11 RICHARD D. GALLUCI, JR. (SBN 144826)  
12 rgallucci@lawsgr.com  
13 SPECTOR GADON & ROSEN, P.C.  
14 1635 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 241-8802

15 PETER B. MARETZ, SBN 144826  
16 pmaretz@stokeswagner.com  
17 JACQUELINE A. GODOY, SBN 259772  
jgodoj@stokeswagner.com  
18 ADAM L. PARRY, SBN 259937  
aparry@stokeswagner.com  
19 STOKES WAGNER HUNT MARETZ &  
TERRELL  
20 600 West Broadway, Suite 910  
San Diego, CA 92101  
Telephone: (619) 232-4261  
Facsimile: (619) 232-4840

21 Attorneys for Defendant  
22 DAVID BROSSO

23 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

24 Dated: April 11, 2016



25 Hon. Nita L. Stormes  
26 United States Magistrate Judge  
27  
28

1 **EXHIBIT A**

2 **ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

3 I, \_\_\_\_\_, of \_\_\_\_\_ [address],  
4 declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the  
5 Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the  
6 Southern District of California on \_\_\_\_\_ in the case of  
7 *MD Insider, Inc. v Brosso*, Case No. 3:15-cv-02395-DMS-NLS. I agree to comply with  
8 and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand  
9 and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and  
10 punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any  
11 manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any  
12 person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

13 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the  
14 Southern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated  
15 Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this  
16 action.

17 I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ of \_\_\_\_\_  
18 \_\_\_\_\_ [address and telephone number] as  
19 my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any  
20 proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

21  
22 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

23 City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

24 Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

25 Signature: \_\_\_\_\_